



# COMMONWEALTH of VIRGINIA

*Hal E. Greer*  
*Director*

*Joint Legislative Audit and Review Commission*  
*201 North 9<sup>th</sup> Street, General Assembly Building, Suite 1100*  
*Richmond, VA 23219*

*(804) 786-1258*

JLARC Economic Development Subcommittee Meeting  
May 8, 2017

## MINUTES

### Attending

#### JLARC Members:

Delegate Chris Jones, Chairman; Senator Janet Howell, Delegate R. Steven Landes, and Delegate John M. O'Bannon.

#### JLARC Staff:

Hal Greer, Director; Kimberly Sarte, Associate Director; Ellen Miller, Chief Analyst for Economic Development; and Paula Lambert.

#### Others:

Charles Kennington (Senate Finance Committee staff); Skip Maupai (House Appropriations Committee staff); Mike Woods (Troutman Sanders); Lisa Wallmeyer (Division of Legislative Services); Brittany West (Hunton & Williams); Michael Martz (Richmond Times Dispatch).

The meeting was called to order at 9:12 a.m. by Delegate Jones, Chairman. Delegate Jones then recognized Ellen Miller, Chief Analyst for Economic Development, who provided the subcommittee with an overview of the decisions made at the November 2016 meeting: include 76 incentives in scope of evaluations, establish a 6- to 8-year cycle for in-depth evaluations, hire a contractor to perform evaluations, and evaluate three film incentives in 2017. Ms. Miller also mentioned that the subcommittee approved the presentation of two reports each year: an in-depth evaluation of individual incentives reported each June, and an overall assessment of incentives reported annually in October or November each year. Subsequently, Ms. Miller reviewed the JLARC staff activities to date: issued an RFP to hire a contractor (November 2016), hired UVA's Weldon Cooper Center for Public Service to perform evaluations (March 2017), and working with contractor to develop the first reports to be presented this fall.

Ms. Miller then reviewed a proposal to add two new incentives created by the 2017 General Assembly to the list of in-scope incentives, add two additional incentives for small businesses, and remove two defunded incentives. Delegate Jones requested a motion to approve these changes. A motion was made by Delegate O'Bannon, seconded by Senator Howell, and approved unanimously by the subcommittee.

Ms. Miller then reviewed a proposal to evaluate nine incentives in 2018 for small businesses and workforce development. Delegate O'Bannon made a motion to approve the list of proposed incentives as presented. The motion was seconded and approved unanimously by the subcommittee.

Lastly, Ms. Miller reviewed the fall meeting schedule with the subcommittee, which includes: a subcommittee meeting in October to receive annual reports and potentially select incentives for 2019 evaluations, briefing the full Commission in November on the annual reports, and a subcommittee meeting in December (an hour before the December 11 JLARC meeting) to receive reports from VEDP. Skip Maupai with the House Appropriations Committee staff informed the subcommittee that Stephen Moret (CEO for VEDP) has expressed an interest in presenting to the subcommittee about the plans that VEDP is developing. Delegate Jones stated that this presentation would need to be at the October subcommittee meeting.

Delegate O'Bannon asked if the incentives evaluations look backwards in time. Ms. Miller confirmed that this is correct. Delegate Jones stated that the key to this subcommittee will be to compare the prior incentives evaluations to how programs are performing now. Delegate Landes said that the incentives evaluations will also provide a benchmark going forward.

There being no further business, the subcommittee adjourned at 9:25 a.m.

Approved by: Hal E. Greer  
Hal E. Greer, Director

Date: 5/15/17

Prepared by: Paula C. Lambert  
Paula C. Lambert  
Manager, Fiscal and Administrative Services  
& Senior Legislative Analyst